



**MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE DEBATES COMMITTEE
HELD AT 5:00 P.M. ON TUESDAY 11 MARCH 2008
IN THE HOLME MEETING ROOM 2, HOLME BUILDING**

PRESENT

- MEMBERS:** Ros Stein, Vice President (*ex officio*)
Alice Dixon, Chair
Daniel Wodak, Director of Debates
Katherine Connolly
Ellen Ferrington Michaelis
Andrew Garrett
Misa Han
Kishan Jasani
James Johnston
Giselle Kenny
Tim Mooney
Sophie Stone
Patrick Wall
Naomi Hart, Immediate Past Director of Debates
- VISITORS:** Ruchir Punjabi, Director
Melissa Brooks
Julia Fetherston
Sam Greenland
- UNION STAFF:** Alistair Cowie, Director, Student Programmes
Amanda Buchanan, Board Secretary
Khym Scott, Committee Secretary
Alan Hui, Committee Secretary

The Chair declared the meeting open at 5:13pm.

1. APOLOGIES AND LEAVE OF ABSENCE

The Committee heard apologies from Ms. Stephanie Paton, requests for late arrival was received from Mr. Kishan Jasani, Ms. Giselle Kenny and Ms. Ellen Ferrington Michaelis and a request for early departure was received from Ms. Misa Han and Mr. Andrew Garrett.

DC 001/08 **RESOLVED** to accept apologies from Ms. Paton, to grant late arrival to Mr. Jasani, Ms. Kenny and Ms. Ferrington Michaelis and to grant early departure to Ms. Han and Mr. Garrett.

Daniel Wodak / Katherine Connolly

DC 002/08 **RESOLVED** to permit attendance to visitors Ms. Amanda Buchanan, Mr. Alan Hui, Ms. Melissa Brooks, Ms. Julia Fetherston and Mr. Sam Greenland.

Patrick Wall / Tim Mooney

2. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

The minutes of the previous meeting held on 22 November 2007 were tabled. Mr. Greenland observed that his surname was not present on Pages 3 and 4. Mr. Patrick Wall noted that he was “appointed as the 2008 Honorary Treasurer of Public Issues and Debates” until such time that Mr. Greenland is appointed as a Committee Member of the Debates Committee.

DC 003/08 **RESOLVED** to accept the minutes of the meetings held on 22 November 2007 as true and accurate records of proceedings, pending changes to the specified errors.

Sophie Stone / Andrew Garrett

3. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

There was no business arising from the minutes.

4. GENERAL BUSINESS

The Chair acknowledged the appointment of Mr. Khym Scott as Committee Secretary to the Debates Committee. The Chair requested that the Committee limit all use of debating-relevant acronyms during discussion and reporting.

4.1 Reports

4.1.1 Director of Debates

The Director of Debates commented on the success of both O-Week and the Demonstration Debate. The Director thanked debaters Ms. Julia Bowes, Mr. Chris Croke, Ms. Anna Garsia, Ms. Naomi Oreb and University of Sydney alumni Mr. Dominic Knight and Mr. Adam Spencer. He reported that Debates had excellent attendance on the Wednesday of O-Week, with less numbers on the Thursday due to bad weather, and fewer numbers on the Friday, with an overall signup of approximately 280 students. The Director also expressed thanks to Mr. Rob Chiarella for his generosity in respect to time during O-Week.

The Director stated that the Demonstration Debate had a huge turnout of attendees, and gave thanks to Mr. Dominic Thurbon, Ms. Sasha Bodero-Smith, Mr. Steve Hind, Mr. Hamish Nairn, Ms. Garsia and Ms. Paton for their involvement. It was also reported that issues arising with bar staff about drinks' values and bar tab, and with Facilities about the BBQ, had been resolved.

[Mr. James Johnston arrived at the meeting at 5:22pm.]

DC 004/08 RESOLVED to formally acknowledge and thank Ms. Bowes, Mr. Croke, Ms. Garsia, Ms. Oreb, Mr. Knight and Mr. Spencer.

Acclamation

DC 005/08 RESOLVED to formally acknowledge and thank Mr. Thurbon, Ms. Bodero-Smith, Mr. Hind, Mr. Nairn, Ms. Garsia and Ms. Paton.

Acclamation

4.1.2. Honorary Treasurer of Public Issues and Debates

There was no report by the Honorary Treasurer of Public Issues and Debates.

DC 006/08 RESOLVED to suspend Standing Orders and move to item **4.1.4 – Women's Officer**

Katherine Connolly / Misa Han

4.1.4. Women's Officer

Ms. Sophie Stone reported that she and Ms. Paton had planned Semester One events, with the first being a social event with drinks and food provided for women to be held Wednesday 19 March. The Director of Debates observed that a room booking for Isabel Fidler had not been made on the assumption that it would conflict with Mr. Ivan Ah Sam's seminar. Ms. Stone outlined that the event has the aim to be held an hour before Regionals to promote female attendance, noting her preference for the event to be held before Easters, due to last year's problem with affirmative action, and use it to also encourage participation in the Australs Womens Tournament on 10 May.

Ms. Fetherston asked whether the Tournament would allow male adjudicators, to which Ms. Stone was unsure, and added that it would possibly include other universities. Ms. Brooks asked whether the structure would be three-on-three. Ms. Stone advised the Committee that if there were any suggestions to why any this should not be the case, that the issue was open for discussion.

Ms. Brooks also asked whether the Women's Officers would consider making the Tournament Pro-Am, and stated that while a social event was important, it would be unfortunate to miss Mr. Ah Sam's seminar, but that the event should not occur post-Easters. The Director of Debates thought that the event could

work in the week after Mr. Ah Sam's seminar, and that it would be easier after Mid-Semester break, just before Easter's tryouts. Ms. Naomi Hart suggested that the perception of asking women to choose between the two events would be met with hostility, and that it should be held after Grand Slam. The Director of Debates, Mr. Greenland and Ms. Fetherston echoed these concerns.

Ms. Stone clarified that it was never an intention to cause a conflict with Mr. Ah Sam's seminar, and proposed a new starting time of 4:30pm. Mr. Cowie reminded the Committee that although it has been a long time since the last meeting, all Members should advise the Chair and the Director of Debates of upcoming events to avoid clashes.

Ms. Fetherston reiterated that the possibility of male adjudicators should be considered with care, with last year's dealings of Mr. Alex Dean in mind. Ms. Brooks added that this should remain as a last resort, and Ms. Hart advised that while there is potential for danger in approaching male adjudicators, there is also danger in not having enough females. Upon clarification of the date, Mr. Wall, Ms. Hart and the Director of Debate were concerned about the lack of time to advertise. Ms. Hart added that in 2007 Easter's was well attended by women, while Grand Slam was not, which Ms. Stone was previously unaware of, and advised to shift the focus of the event.

After further discussion of potential dates, Mr. Mooney suggested that Mr. Ah Sam's seminar be cancelled, and was not worried about the potential to reschedule. The Chair asked that discussion then concern holding the event during Grand Slam. Ms. Stone, Mr. Wall and Mr. Greenland held the opinion that this would only serve to segregate women from men during Grand Slam, and Ms. Brooks reminded the Committee that this may exclude those women in the grand final.

[Ms. Ros Stein arrived at the meeting at 5:45pm.]

DC 007/08 **RESOLVED** to defer the motion to make the Women's Tournament Pro-Am provided that there is not a lack of female adjudicators until further discussion with Ms. Paton.

Naomi Hart / Sophie Stone

[Ms. Giselle Kenny arrived at the meeting at 5:46pm.]

DC 008/08 **RESOLVED** to resume Standing Orders and return to item **4.1.3 – Intersity Director**

Katherine Connolly / Sophie Stone

4.1.3. Intersity Director

Ms. Kenny reported that all five teams and many adjudicators broke, and that Ms. Oreb had attained the titles of fifth best speaker, highest female speaker, and highest Australasian speaker.

Ms. Hart reporting on the World Universities' Peace Invitational Debating Tournament advised that both Mr. Croke and Mr. Hind won and Ms. Bowes and Ms. Oreb broke, with Mr. Brad Lankan and Mr. Ah San adjudicating.

Ms. Kenny and Mr. Wall advised the Committee that they need selection panels for Easters, and chose to discuss dates for selection before lists of selectors. Potential dates proposed were 2 to 4 April, with callbacks on 4 April in order to send details for Macquarie University by 7 April.

[Mr. Ruchir Punjabi arrived at the meeting at 5:50pm.]

Ms. Kenny acknowledged that the proposed dates were problematic, and Mr. Wall reiterated that Macquarie required full team list information by 7 April. Ms. Brooks and Ms. Hart expressed worry about holding callbacks on a Friday and suggested a few alternatives. Ms. Kenny proposed that the Committee have two contingencies dependant on Mr. Wall finding out whether the deadlines were moveable. Mr. Greenland also suggested that if such information is necessary, to ask for it from attendees on the first day of signups, and asked whether a weekend should be considered. Ms. Hart commented that debating events were already asking people to commit to too many weekends. The Chair stated that in future Macquarie should be asked for extensions due to Sydney University holding a larger contingency.

The Director of Debates recommended to the Committee that the dates 7 and 9 April be a first option provided Macquarie allowed a late submission, followed by either Wednesday 2 April and Thursday 3 April, or Monday 31 March and Wednesday 2 April if it could not. He called for a vote on the second option; Wednesday 2 April and Thursday 3 April was decided.

[Ms. Ros Stein left the meeting at 6:01pm.]

DC 009/08 RESOLVED to hold the dates of Easters selections on 7 and 9 April, provided that Macquarie University allows a late submission of information, and 2 and 3 April, should it not.

Daniel Wodak / Giselle Kenny

The Chair reminded the Committee that they needed to nominate several Easters selectors, keeping in mind that one position must be filled by a Women's Officer or delegate.

[Ms. Ellen Ferrington Michaelis arrived at the meeting at 6:10pm.]

DC 010/08 RESOLVED to move the discussion *in camera*.

Sophie Stone / Naomi Hart

DC 011/08 RESOLVED to invite visitors to remain.

Patrick Wall / Ellen Ferrington Michaelis

DC 014/08 RESOLVED to move the discussion *ex camera*.

Andrew Garrett / Sophie Stone

Mr. Wall advised the Committee of the Easters policy on under-age entrants, and read it to the Committee.

"Underage Participants Policy:

Students under the age of 18 years at the time of the tournament are welcome to attend, but the Convenors will be applying a strict guardianship policy. This will require any contingent which includes an underage participant to allocate a unique responsible adult as temporary guardian. This individual will accept equal responsibility for the underage participant, and the details of both will be supplied to all licensed premises. These measures are in place only to ensure access to all social events, and the Organising Committee will not hesitate to remove either or both participants from the tournament if this policy, and the good will of our provider establishments, is breached."

DC 015/08 RESOLVED to grant the Committee a time extension of up to 30 minutes.

Katherine Connolly / Patrick Wall

Ms. Fetherston ridiculed the legality of this policy. The Chair suggested Mr. Cowie as the appointed temporary guardian for those entrants rather than an Officer.

DC 016/08 RESOLVED to nominate Ms. Cowie as the appointed temporary guardian responsible for underage students in attendance at Easters.

James Johnston / Patrick Wall

Ms. Kenny further outlined the intervarsity programme, stating that Australs is running 3 to 11 July, Women's Debating Competition on 10 May, Michael Kirby Plain English Speaking Competition on 22 May, and Australs on 24 and 25 May.

Ms. Fetherston reminded the Committee that 24 May is the same day as a Women's College event. Ms. Hart suggested that Australs be held on a single day, and the Chair resolved to remove 24 May as a potential day. The Director of Debates suggested moving the event to 17 and 18 May, and Ms. Hart stressing the necessity of flexibility for attendees expressed views against weekday callbacks, and suggested that the Committee select two sets of dates to approach selectors with as was done in 2007.

DC 017/08 RESOLVED to approach selectors with the selection dates of the Australs 17 and 18 May, and 24 and 25 May.

Tim Mooney / Naomi Hart

DC 018/08 RESOLVED to accept the Report of the Intervarsity Director.

Daniel Wodak / Sophie Stone

[Mr. Patrick Wall left the meeting at 6:39pm.]

DC 019/08 RESOLVED to suspend Standing Orders and move to item **4.1.9 – Development Officer**

Katherine Connolly / Sophie Stone

4.1.9. Development Officer

Mr. Tim Mooney reported that Development Seminars were beginning this week, and that the Director of Debates should resend a previous email in regards to these seminars. Mr. Mooney advised the Committee that he was holding a seminar on Rebuttal on 12 March, and that Mr. Ah Sam was holding a seminar on International Relations on 2 April.

Mr. Mooney also mentioned the Mentoring Programme, where one mentor will be paired with four teams in the period before Easters, but not during, so as not to deplete Easters of potential adjudicators. Ms. Hart suggested that expressions of interest be called for, and Ms. Brooks advised that the Committee reuse the Easters selectors list, with the exception of Mr. James Greenwood. The Director of Debates asked the Committee to consider creating an official position of coach of Easters teams.

DC 020/08 RESOLVED to formally recognise the position of Easters Mentors.

Tim Mooney / Katherine Connolly

DC 021/08 RESOLVED to accept the Report of the Development Officer.

James Johnston / Naomi Oreb

DC 022/08 RESOLVED to resume Standing Orders and return to item **4.1.5 – Communications Director**

Katherine Connolly / Sophie Stone

[Ms. Julia Fetherston left the meeting at 6:44pm.]

4.1.5. Communications Director

The Director of Debates spoke in the absence of Mr. Garrett. He reported that the Debates handbook was completed, with most Committee Members

providing entries in due time. He expressed thanks to the USU MarComms staff for their help and work on the handbook.

The Chair reported on the state of the Debate website, stating that the USU website was currently being redeveloped over the next six months and it would be impossible to upload a Debates website in that time.

DC 023/08 **RESOLVED** to formally acknowledge and thank USU MarComms staff Ms. Anjali Belani, Mr. Carl Ahearn and Ms. Irina Belova.

Acclamation

DC 024/08 **RESOLVED** to accept the Report of the Communications Officer.

Giselle Kenny / James Johnston

DC 025/08 **RESOLVED** to resume Standing Orders and return to item **4.1.4 – Women’s Officer**

Katherine Connolly / Patrick Wall

4.1.4. Women’s Officer

Mr. Wall advised the Committee that he had spoken to Macquarie University, and confirmed that their main concern was the receiving of funds on 7 April, and that they were of the opinion that there would not be a problem holding trials on 7 and 9 April, and submitting details of entrants on 10 April.

Ms. Stone in turn suggested that the women’s event be held 2 April, on the provision that there is not a seminar on the same day.

[Mr. Ruchir Punjabi left the meeting at 6:47pm.]

DC 026/08 **RESOLVED** that the date and time of 5:00pm 2 April be that of the Women’s Event, on the provision that there is not a seminar at the same time.

Sophie Stone / Katherine Connolly

[Mr. Ruchir Punjabi arrived at the meeting at 6:48pm.]

DC 027/08 **RESOLVED** to suspend Standing Orders and move to item **4.1.6 – Union Competitions Directors**

Katherine Connolly / Patrick Wall

4.1.6. Union Competitions Directors

Ms. Katherine Connolly advised the Committee that Grand Slam had been organised, with flyers including an email address present at O-Week, and that

she had so far received five female debater and five female adjudicator signups.

Ms. Hart told the Committee that more advertising was possible at Regionals tomorrow, asking the Director of Debates to provide an outline of the topics. The Director of Debates replied that most topics were yet to be confirmed. Ms. Hart also reported that Regionals would be catered by Wentworth Uni Brothers, and the Director of Debates confirmed that twelve rooms had been booked.

DC 028/08 **RESOLVED** to accept the Report of the Union Competitions Directors.

Kishan Jasani / Sophie Stone

4.1.7. Schools Liaison Officer

The Chair advised the Committee to defer setting dates for future Schools events until the next Committee meeting, and to just receive a Report.

Mr. James Johnston reported that most Schools had paid their contributions, although some payments were outstanding, and that no kids had been lost. He also noted that there was an increase in attendance numbers this year, despite an increase in cost. The Chair asked Mr. Johnston to follow up on outstanding payments.

Mr. Johnston outlined that there will be two more Schools events in 2008, potentially the first during the break between Semesters, and the second during Semester Two. The Director of Debates added that the only things remaining to do are the setting of event dates, and making changes to the handbooks to include coaching opportunities.

Ms. Hart advised Mr. Johnston that a written report including a budget must be submitted within two weeks of each event, to add to the Director of Debates' report and to be received by USU Programmes Manager Ms. Louise Anthony.

DC 029/08 **RESOLVED** to accept the Report of the Schools Liaison Officer and formally acknowledge and thank Mr. Johnston and the Director of Debates for their work on Schools Day.

Acclamation

4.1.8. Social Directors

The Director of Debates reported that a lawn bowls party was being planned for the first Wednesday after Easters. Camperdown Bowling Club had been contacted and quoted \$15.00 per head, and other venues are being investigated. He also asked the Committee whether they would consider cutting out a Regionals week for Easters. The Chair asked that this motion be considered at the next Committee meeting due to time.

DC 030/08 RESOLVED to accept the Report of the Social Directors.

Katherine Connolly / Sophie Stone

4.2 Michael Kirby Plain English Speaking Award

The Director of Debates proposed that the format of the competition in 2008 be spread over two days before the final, rather than four weeks as has been done previously. He also suggested that more focus be spent on advertising the prize of \$1000.00.

4.3 USU Coaching Opportunities

The Director of Debates referred to the schools' handbook, and proposed that advertisements be placed in the next edition for the hiring of coaches, who would provide day-long workshops. He advised that the Department of Education and Training charges \$200.00 per day for this service, and suggested that the Committee advertise charges of \$220.00 per day, of which the USU would keep \$40.00 and the coach would keep \$180.00. The Director of Debates said that this programme would be great to reserve for those on Committee or to offset personal expenses.

Ms. Brooks asked whether this programme would be targeted at private schools, and the Director of Debates advised that both public and private schools would be advertised to. Mr. Wall suggested that University of Sydney debaters be approached with this idea to get a sense of whether this would work, to which it was reminded that there was no harm in attempting such a programme or obligation to fulfil it.

5. OTHER BUSINESS

The Chair advised the Committee to join the Debates Facebook group. The Director of Debates added that if any Committee member was unhappy with their Facebook officer title that they could request it to be changed.

6. NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the Committee will be held at 5:00pm on Thursday 17 April; location to be confirmed.

7. CLOSE OF MEETING

With no other business to be attended to the Chair declared the meeting closed at 6:59pm.